Review Article

Telehealth in India: The Apollo contribution and an overview

K. Ganapathy *

President, Apollo Telemedicine Networking Foundation, Apollo Hospitals, 21 Greames lane, Chennai 600006, India

ABSTRACT

The universal phenomenon of urban rural health divide is particularly striking in India. We have centres of medical excellence in the metros, better than the best. However 700 million Indians, have no direct access to secondary and tertiary care as 80% of India's specialists, primarily cater to 20% of the population. Additional brick and mortar hospitals is not a viable solution, as there is an acute shortage of both funds and health care personnel. In 1999, the author among others, foresaw that it could be possible, to extend the reach of urban doctors to suburban and rural India, virtually. This article traces the author's personal experience in introducing and developing telehealth in India over the last 14 years.

1. Introduction

Telemedicine is a term encompassing all methods used to examine, investigate, monitor and treat, with the patient and doctor, physically located in different places, transferring the expertise. Unnecessary travelling of patients and escorts is eliminated. Image acquisition, storage, display, processing, and transfer, form the basis of telemedicine. In the last few
years telehealth (a more inclusive term) has grown exponentially. India, considered a developing country, is however a paradox. We produce and launch our own satellites, plant a flag on the moon\(^{30}\) and have sent an unmanned mission to Mars.\(^{31}\) We have centres of medical excellence better than the best. In 2012, 200,000 patients came to India from overseas, for health care, spending 2.3 billion\(^{32}\). However 700 million Indians, have no direct access to secondary and tertiary care, having to travel 40–100 km. The National eGovernance Plan has mGovernance as a major division showing the unprecedented growth and development in ICT. India neither follows nor piggybacks on advanced countries, we leapfrog! Setting up telecommunication infrastructure in rural areas, to increase reach of urban specialists, is easier than making available specialists physically. Knowing that a specialist is only a mouse click away, does wonders for one’s morale. Digital information is also easy to disseminate, widely available, relatively inexpensive and can level the playing field.

2. History of Apollo telemedicine

Clinical telemedicine was formally initiated in South Asia, when the world’s first VSAT enabled village hospital, at Arangoda, a village in Andhra Pradesh a state in South India, where Dr Prathap C Reddy Founder Chairman of the Apollo Hospitals Group was born, was commissioned on March 24th 2000 by the then US President Bill Clinton. Speaking on the occasion Clinton remarked “I think it is a wonderful contribution, to the healthcare of the people living in villages. I hope that people all over the world, will follow your lead so that the benefits of hi tech medicine will go to everyone and not just those who live in big cities”.\(^{33}\) Over the last 14 years with 135 centres including 15 overseas, Apollo Telemedicine has become the largest and oldest multi speciality Telemedicine Network. In addition telehealth, is already being provided as a pilot, by Apollo in 225 Common Service Centres of the Dept of Electronics and Information Technology, Govt of India.\(^{34}\) Ultimately the government expects to commission 100,000 such internet enabled kiosks. Over 80,000 teleconsultations have been provided in 25 specialities for distances from 100 to 4500 miles. Apollo Telemedicine Networking Foundation is a Not for Profit Company whereas Apollo Telehealth Services is the commercial arm. ATNF was the first to provide proof of concept validation studies in remote diagnosis using wireless 3G technology\(^{35,36}\) and to start a Telehealth Technology concept validation studies in remote diagnosis using wireless commercial arm. ATNF was the first to provide proof of for Profit Company whereas Apollo Telehealth Services is the best. In 2009, 190 grand rounds in six specialities, have been conducted between different Apollo hospitals using multipoint VC. 21 clinical meetings and conferences with multiple overseas centres have been carried out in addition to webcasting complex unusual surgical procedures.\(^{36–58}\) Attempts are being made to deliver health care in rural India as well.\(^{59–62}\)

2.1. Virtual visits to ICU

I-SEE-U\(^{70–72}\) is a state of the art solution to enable virtual visits to ICU patients, from anywhere in the world, by authorised consultants, friends and relatives. Reduced physical visits leads to better infection control. Simultaneously, this facilitates additional ICU visits. The remotely enabled networked camera in the individual ICU cubicle can also focus on the various monitors. Commissioned recently, the six hundred thirty five users have given an excellent feedback.

3. eICU

eICU’s\(^{3,64}\) where smaller ICU’s are connected to highly trained experienced intensivists in larger ICU’s are now a reality in the state of Tamilnadu and some other states. Expert advice to physicians, bedside staff and patients for management of critically ill patients in smaller ICU’s and initiation of mechanical ventilation or non-invasive ventilation, and haemodynamic monitoring support are provided.

4. Tele ophthalmology

In 2013 alone, 306,170 teleconsultations were done in the Aravind Eye System including 190,878 new and 115,292 review patients.\(^{63}\) Sankara Nethralaya has carried out 461,724 teleconsults from Oct 2003\(^{56}\). The Tripura Vision Centre project is a Public Private Partnership program with the Department of Health & Family Welfare and the National Program for Blindness Control. (NPCB) covering a population of 300,000. Remote teleophthalmic services to rural areas have been successfully carried out\(^{57,64}\). Ophthalmologists in Karnataka in South India use their iPhones to screen infants in rural and semi-urban areas for retinopathy of prematurity.\(^{59}\)

5. Tele education and the National Medical College Network

The Ministry of Health, Govt. of India is interlinking medical colleges across the country thru a National Medical College Network (NMCN)\(^{70,71}\) for common e-Education. National
Resource Centers and Regional Resource Centers for NMCN have been identified. High speed optic fibre based internet bandwidth up to 1 Gigabyte per second is being deployed under the National Knowledge Network Project initially in 150 medical colleges. More than 500 grand rounds have been carried out between the various tertiary Apollo Hospitals using multi point video conferencing with an in-house Bridge. Apollo Hospitals, Chennai is one of the 10 superspeciality hospitals in India connected to 39 countries in Africa under the Govt of India Pan African e-Network project. 2500 lectures have been delivered for doctors in Africa through this network.\textsuperscript{12} The School of Bioinformatics and Telemedicine located at the SGPDI Lucknow (Sanjay Gandhi Postgraduate Institute of Medical Education and Research) is the National Resource Centre for Telemedicine. Under the leadership of Prof Saroj Mishra the School is playing a major role in tele education in the health sector. A wide variety of papers have been published\textsuperscript{15–17,73–85} encompassing telementoring and tele training in surgery and surgical endocrinology.

6. The National telehealth scenario

Today there are about 600 telemedicine units mostly in the suburbs. Though utilisation is suboptimal, there is optimism. Several publications\textsuperscript{8,86–101} have reviewed the specific problems encountered in setting up telemedicine units in different areas, use of telemedicine in giant gatherings e.g. the Kumbh Mela where 120 million people congregated in 2013. Teleconsults originating from India to other countries through the government and the private sector has been in vogue for several years. Introducing telemedicine in the medical/IT curriculum and passing a Telehealth Act of India is awaited. The rise of internet use in India and the health implications has been commented in the British Medical Journal.\textsuperscript{102} It has been proposed that as rural India will soon be internet ready, the acute shortage of healthcare providers could be addressed by mandatory “Virtual Rural Postings” for urban located health care personnel.\textsuperscript{103} A valuable by-product, if this innovative suggestion is implemented, is that tens of thousands of urban doctors using cutting edge technology, would gain an insight into, and appreciation of problems in rural areas. Constant virtual access to experienced urban specialists will also benefit the rural healthcare provider eventually increasing the latter’s level of competence. A carrot and stick policy with incentives and disincentives needs to be implemented.

7. Telemedicine enabled Hospital on Wheels

There are about fifty five operational “Hospital on Wheels” (HoW) Many of them are VSAT enabled. A villager gets into an air-conditioned mobile truck which has an ultrasound, X-ray, echocardiogram, ECG, biochemical laboratory, ophthalmic equipment etc. A technician focuses the ophthalmoscope into the eyes of the patient, and the image of the fundus is evaluated by the teleophthalmologist in the tertiary care centre.\textsuperscript{45,66} Through internet or a VSAT on the truck, video conferencing and transmission of images is enabled. While many HoWs are dedicated to ophthalmology, diabetology and psychiatry multi-purpose HoWs are also available. In a first of its kind initiative, 527 patients in 13 different specialities were connected simultaneously to six tertiary Apollo hospitals, in different parts of India from a HoW at a mega health camp held at Ajmer in Northern India on 11th and 12th February 2012. Remote clinical evaluation was followed by ePrescriptions. Subsequently similar telecamps were held in different parts of Tamilnadu in southern India.\textsuperscript{104,105}

8. The national ICT scenario

Information and Communication Technology is growing exponentially with rural tele-density approaching 48%. The Govt. of India’s National Telecom Policy envisages even a ‘Right to Broadband’ scenario by 2020.\textsuperscript{106} The United Nations has already declared access to the Internet a human right. A government funded fibre optic network connecting 250,000 villages launched in October 2011 when complete could truly transform remote healthcare delivery.

8.1. mHealth

In August 2007 the author was requested by Ericsson, to study for the first time in South Asia, the feasibility of doing remote clinical examinations entirely through wireless connectivity.\textsuperscript{25,36} In July 2008 The Rockefeller Foundation organised a Making the eHealth Connection Conference at Bellagio Italy\textsuperscript{107} The author presented a paper on “mHealth: A potential tool for Health care delivery in India”.\textsuperscript{108} The term mHealth was conceptualised here for the first time. None could have foreseen the phenomenal explosion of mHealth or the utilisation of smart phones in the “third world”. With 894 million phones,\textsuperscript{23} mBanking, mEntertainment, mCommerce and mGovernance are becoming a reality, but mHealth today is conspicuous by its relative absence. Pilots and proof of concept studies in various aspects of mHealth are abound in India. Hundreds of thousands of SMSs sent every day by government health departments, NGOs and the private sector are ensuring better adherence and compliance be it for immunisation, vaccination, ante natal counselling, or blood sugar evaluation. Medical Call centres are providing authenticated validated health information through mobile phones. Thousands of health “apps” can now be downloaded. VC through mobiles, using 3G and eventually 4G is on the anvil. The author among others, throu publications and presentations, are creating awareness on the untapped potential of mHealth in India.\textsuperscript{109–119} The transformative potential of mHealth in India, however hinges on its acceptance and use. A multilingual field survey was carried out by the author between Oct 2012 and April 2013. 1886 valid responses were analysed (69% urban and 31% rural). 46% of the urban sample had smart phones vs 22% in rural areas. 72% in urban and 48% in rural areas were aware of mHealth. 55% (urban and rural) showed a very strong intent to use mHealth. The study\textsuperscript{120} revealed that Rural and Urban India appear to be ready to use mHealth but the solutions need to be customised. Utilisation depends on education, empowerment and building trust. With 15 million broadband connections, 35 million internet subscribers 100 million PCs but 894 million mobile phones, mHealth is obviously more relevant in India.
9. Technical issues

Effective delivery of telehealth services requires maintaining standards with reference to privacy, authentication, confidentiality, telecommunications, records, authorised access to patient data, encryption, guaranteed reliability, interpretability, legal obligations, multimedia applications, performance levels and security. This must be an ongoing process. Interoperability of systems, compatibility and scalability are a must. Constant benchmarking of equipments is required meeting international DICOM standards. Several publications from India have addressed these and other allied issues. Standardising, certifying, authenticating and registering telemedicine units to ensure uniformity is the next step.

10. Patient empowerment in rural India

Health Literacy is critical in improving health outcomes. Deploying multi point Videoconferencing the author has initiated a knowledge empowerment programme at the internet enabled Village Resource Centers of the MS Swaminathan Research Foundation in rural Tamilnadu. Consultants interacted with 6050 villagers in 18 villages. The Q&A interactive sessions were stimulating. Using MCQ’s, knowledge levels were measured. The modest increase of 20% was attributed to unfamiliarity with the MCQ model. Feedback was excellent. Use of visuals and videos made the interaction more meaningful. More important, was the subsequent discussion the attendees had, with those who were unable to partake.

11. Global telehealth initiatives of Govt of India

The Ministry of External Affairs, Govt. of India initiated the Pan Africa e-Network project for teleconsultations in 2009. Through this network Apollo Hospitals Chennai is connected to 39 countries in Africa. The SAARC e-Network for South Asian Countries and the ASEAN network is being followed by the Central Asia e-Network Project. The 5 Central Asian CIS countries Uzbekistan, Kazakhstan Kyrgyzstan, Turkmenistan and Tajikistan will be connected to India for Telemedicine and Tele-education services for five years. Five reputed Universities and Superspeciality Hospitals in India will be connected through a dedicated network, to a Study Centre/ICT Resource Center and a leading hospital, in each CA country. This hospital may further connect to their secondary hospitals in remote areas. Post Graduate, Under Graduate, Certificate and Diploma Programs in various disciplines through distance education via on-line teaching hosted at each of the Indian Universities will be made available.

11.1. Social and ethical issues

For telehealth to be integrated into the health care system, social, ethical and legal issues need to be addressed. Organisational matters, absence of a self sustaining/revenue generating model and human factors, not technology, are the deterrent factors. Traditionally socio-economic factors, geography, age, education, cultural and ethnic beliefs are considered in a face to face doctor - patient encounter. With telemedicine, the healer could be in Chennai and the to be healed in Uzbekistan. Telehealth should not result in depersonalization or diminish trust. Tele diagnosis must be followed with appropriate referrals for investigations and subsequent management. Producing cost effective appropriate technology, hardware and software and ensuring connectivity alone is insufficient. Short term courses to train trainers and users, reimbursement (teleconsults quadrupled in USA when insurance companies reimbursed teleconsults), getting grants, subsidies and waivers to introduce telehealth is necessary.

12. Conclusion

Accessible quality healthcare to anyone, anytime anywhere at affordable cost, will be the new mantra. The most important enabler to make these breakthroughs come true, is not further advances in technology, but meticulous attention to WiIFM. For every single stakeholder in the entire ecosystem. The question “What Is In It For Me” has to be satisfactorily addressed. A solution is not a solution unless it is universally accepted and available. With private players playing the major role, particularly in secondary and tertiary health care it behoves them to extend their reach and provide health care particularly where it is not available.

Conflicts of interest

The author has none to declare.

Acknowledgements

The author wishes to place on record his deep sense of gratitude to the directors of the Apollo Hospital Group particularly the Founder Chairman Dr Prathap Reddy, Ms Sangita Reddy and Ms. Preetha Reddy for their vision and for providing the infrastructure to make telehealth a reality in India. I am also thankful to all my colleagues and to my wife Vijayalakshmi not only for the technical assistance, but also to the whole hearted support given over several decades.

References


21. No need to visit, you can see patients through I-See-U: http://www.thehindu.com/news/national/tamil-nadu/no-need-to-visit-you-can-see-patients-through-iseeu/article5190555.ece.


51. Can Telemedicine Alleviate India Health Care Problems? Published: March 08, 2012 in India Knowledge@Wharton http://knowledge.wharton.upenn.edu/india/article.cfm;jsessionid=a830c2b096752beab04b3b561e666d1a6548?articleid=4675.


100. Ganapathy K. Tele-Health is being viewed as a distinct service, as a subspecialty. eHealth. April 2011;6(04):48–49.
109. The UN Foundation and Vodafone Foundation Technology Partnership. mHealth Alliance; 2011:59. www.unfoundation.org/tech4dev.
112. CSIR sponsored National workshop 17th Sep 2012, Chennai Mobile Application Development for mHealth Inaugural Address http://www.drmgudu.ac.in/Events/Pre/CSE/Sept12/MobileApp.htm.